

EXHIBIT A

Young, Cassidy T.

From: Padmanabhan, Krishnan <KPadmanabhan@winston.com>
Sent: Wednesday, August 9, 2023 8:46 PM
To: Goodrich, Christina N.; Soskin, Peter E.
Cc: Benyacar, David; Boardman, Albert; Long, Betsy; Brown, Melissa; DeWitt, Amy; Dacus, Deron (EXTERNAL); Wesley Hill; Andrea Fair; Reisner, Daniel; Dial, Claire Elise; EntropicKLG; Raghavan, Saranya; Young, Cassidy T.
Subject: RE: Entropic v. Charter & Charter (051 and 052 Cases)

External Sender:

Christina –

Charter objects to cross use.

Thanks,
KP

Krishnan Padmanabhan

Partner

Winston & Strawn LLP

D: +1 212-294-3564

winston.com

WINSTON
& STRAWN
LLP

From: Goodrich, Christina N. <Christina.Goodrich@klgates.com>
Sent: Wednesday, August 9, 2023 10:46 PM
To: Padmanabhan, Krishnan <KPadmanabhan@winston.com>; Soskin, Peter E. <Peter.Soskin@klgates.com>
Cc: Benyacar, David <David.Benyacar@arnoldporter.com>; Boardman, Albert <Albert.Boardman@arnoldporter.com>; Long, Betsy <Elizabeth.Long@arnoldporter.com>; Brown, Melissa <Melissa.Brown@arnoldporter.com>; DeWitt, Amy <Amy.DeWitt@arnoldporter.com>; Dacus, Deron (EXTERNAL) <ddacus@dacusfirm.com>; Wesley Hill <wh@wsfirm.com>; Andrea Fair <andrea@wsfirm.com>; Reisner, Daniel <Daniel.Reisner@arnoldporter.com>; Dial, Claire Elise <CDial@winston.com>; EntropicKLG <EntropicKLG@klgates.com>; Raghavan, Saranya <SRaghavan@winston.com>; Young, Cassidy T. <Cassidy.Young@klgates.com>
Subject: RE: Entropic v. Charter & Charter (051 and 052 Cases)

Hi: Thank you - indeed, still working through my emails from today.

Can you please let me know your position on cross use?

Best,
Christina

From: Padmanabhan, Krishnan <KPadmanabhan@winston.com>
Sent: Wednesday, August 09, 2023 7:41 PM
To: Goodrich, Christina N. <Christina.Goodrich@klgates.com>; Soskin, Peter E. <Peter.Soskin@klgates.com>

Cc: Benyacar, David <David.Benyacar@arnoldporter.com>; Boardman, Albert <Albert.Boardman@arnoldporter.com>; Long, Betsy <Elizabeth.Long@arnoldporter.com>; Brown, Melissa <Melissa.Brown@arnoldporter.com>; DeWitt, Amy <Amy.DeWitt@arnoldporter.com>; Dacus, Deron (EXTERNAL) <ddacus@dacusfirm.com>; Wesley Hill <wh@wsfirm.com>; Andrea Fair <andrea@wsfirm.com>; Reisner, Daniel <Daniel.Reisner@arnoldporter.com>; Dial, Claire Elise <CDial@winston.com>; EntropicKLG <EntropicKLG@klgates.com>; Raghavan, Saranya <SRaghavan@winston.com>; Young, Cassidy T. <Cassidy.Young@klgates.com>
Subject: RE: Entropic v. Charter & Charter (051 and 052 Cases)

Christina –

You are a few emails behind, likely because you were in court all day (like us).

We asked the Entropic team to prepare a draft where the parties can input their respective proposals, as we will not be able to reach agreement based on the meet and confer. (see attached)

Thanks

KP

Krishnan Padmanabhan

Partner

Winston & Strawn LLP

D: +1 212-294-3564

winston.com

**WINSTON
& STRAWN**
LLP

From: Goodrich, Christina N. <Christina.Goodrich@klgates.com>

Sent: Wednesday, August 9, 2023 10:34 PM

To: Soskin, Peter E. <Peter.Soskin@klgates.com>; Padmanabhan, Krishnan <KPadmanabhan@winston.com>

Cc: Benyacar, David <David.Benyacar@arnoldporter.com>; Boardman, Albert <Albert.Boardman@arnoldporter.com>; Long, Betsy <Elizabeth.Long@arnoldporter.com>; Brown, Melissa <Melissa.Brown@arnoldporter.com>; DeWitt, Amy <Amy.DeWitt@arnoldporter.com>; Dacus, Deron (EXTERNAL) <ddacus@dacusfirm.com>; Wesley Hill <wh@wsfirm.com>; Andrea Fair <andrea@wsfirm.com>; Reisner, Daniel <Daniel.Reisner@arnoldporter.com>; Dial, Claire Elise <CDial@winston.com>; EntropicKLG <EntropicKLG@klgates.com>; Raghavan, Saranya <SRaghavan@winston.com>; Young, Cassidy T. <Cassidy.Young@klgates.com>

Subject: RE: Entropic v. Charter & Charter (051 and 052 Cases)

Hi KP: Just following up on Pete's email below.

Are you able to confirm your agreement with our proposal below so that we can finalize the discovery order and get it on file on Thursday?

Best,
Christina

From: Soskin, Peter E. <Peter.Soskin@klgates.com>

Sent: Tuesday, August 08, 2023 10:34 PM

To: Padmanabhan, Krishnan <KPadmanabhan@winston.com>

Cc: Benyacar, David <David.Benyacar@arnoldporter.com>; Boardman, Albert <Albert.Boardman@arnoldporter.com>;

Long, Betsy <Elizabeth.Long@arnoldporter.com>; Brown, Melissa <Melissa.Brown@arnoldporter.com>; DeWitt, Amy <Amy.DeWitt@arnoldporter.com>; Dacus, Deron (EXTERNAL) <ddacus@dacusfirm.com>; Wesley Hill <wh@wsfirm.com>; Andrea Fair <andrea@wsfirm.com>; Reisner, Daniel <Daniel.Reisner@arnoldporter.com>; Dial, Claire Elise <CDial@winston.com>; EntropicKLG <EntropicKLG@klgates.com>; Raghavan, Saranya <SRaghavan@winston.com>

Subject: RE: Entropic v. Charter & Charter (051 and 052 Cases)

Thank you, KP,

With this new reduction in the proposed discovery, it appears your previous position, along with its justification - that the other cases had the same discovery - was disingenuous and, thus, Charter did not meet and confer in good faith.

In the 125 case, Charter agreed to 40 interrogatories, and 60 hours of deposition.

In the 050 case, Charter agreed to 30 interrogatories, and 60 hours of deposition.

Now in a case that Charter contends involves vastly different technology and will not have overlapping witnesses, Charter now suggests 30 interrogatories, and only 50 hours of deposition for both party and non-party witnesses

Charter ignores the proposal for a cross-use agreement.

Entropic proposes 30 interrogatories in this case, with an agreement that interrogatories from all cases may be used in all cases, and the identification of 10 interrogatories from the 125 case for continuing supplementation throughout the litigation of the Consolidated cases.

Entropic will agree to the 50 hours if there is no objection to the use of the depositions in the 125 and 050 case being used in the instant litigation.

Regards,

Peter Soskin
K&L Gates LLP
4 Embarcadero Center Suite 1200
San Francisco CA 94111
Phone: (415) 882-8046

From: Padmanabhan, Krishnan <KPadmanabhan@winston.com>
Sent: Tuesday, August 8, 2023 2:47 PM
To: Soskin, Peter E. <Peter.Soskin@klgates.com>
Cc: Benyacar, David <David.Benyacar@arnoldporter.com>; Boardman, Albert <Albert.Boardman@arnoldporter.com>; Long, Betsy <Elizabeth.Long@arnoldporter.com>; Brown, Melissa <Melissa.Brown@arnoldporter.com>; DeWitt, Amy <Amy.DeWitt@arnoldporter.com>; Dacus, Deron (EXTERNAL) <ddacus@dacusfirm.com>; Wesley Hill <wh@wsfirm.com>; Andrea Fair <andrea@wsfirm.com>; Reisner, Daniel <Daniel.Reisner@arnoldporter.com>; Dial, Claire Elise <CDial@winston.com>; EntropicKLG <EntropicKLG@klgates.com>; Raghavan, Saranya <SRaghavan@winston.com>
Subject: RE: Entropic v. Charter & Charter (051 and 052 Cases)

Peter –

The redlines may have been stripped from my prior email. Please find them shown in the attached pdf.

Thanks
KP

Krishnan Padmanabhan

Partner

Winston & Strawn LLP

D: +1 212-294-3564

winston.com



From: Padmanabhan, Krishnan

Sent: Tuesday, August 8, 2023 3:46 PM

To: 'Soskin, Peter E.' <Peter.Soskin@klgates.com>

Cc: Benyacar, David <David.Benyacar@arnoldporter.com>; Boardman, Albert <Albert.Boardman@arnoldporter.com>; Long, Betsy <Elizabeth.Long@arnoldporter.com>; Brown, Melissa <Melissa.Brown@arnoldporter.com>; DeWitt, Amy <Amy.DeWitt@arnoldporter.com>; Dacus, Deron (EXTERNAL) <ddacus@dacusfirm.com>; Wesley Hill <wh@wsfirm.com>; Andrea Fair <andrea@wsfirm.com>; Reisner, Daniel <Daniel.Reisner@arnoldporter.com>; Dial, Claire Elise <CDial@winston.com>; EntropicKLG <EntropicKLG@klgates.com>; Raghavan, Saranya <SRaghavan@winston.com>

Subject: RE: Entropic v. Charter & Charter (051 and 052 Cases)

Peter –

Please find Charter's redlines to the discovery order attached.

You could not articulate Entropic's basis for deviating from the prior discovery orders.

Thanks,

KP

Krishnan Padmanabhan

Partner

Winston & Strawn LLP

D: +1 212-294-3564

winston.com



From: Soskin, Peter E. <Peter.Soskin@klgates.com>

Sent: Monday, August 7, 2023 7:42 PM

To: Padmanabhan, Krishnan <KPadmanabhan@winston.com>

Cc: Benyacar, David <David.Benyacar@arnoldporter.com>; Boardman, Albert <Albert.Boardman@arnoldporter.com>; Long, Betsy <Elizabeth.Long@arnoldporter.com>; Brown, Melissa <Melissa.Brown@arnoldporter.com>; DeWitt, Amy <Amy.DeWitt@arnoldporter.com>; Dacus, Deron (EXTERNAL) <ddacus@dacusfirm.com>; Wesley Hill <wh@wsfirm.com>; Andrea Fair <andrea@wsfirm.com>; Reisner, Daniel <Daniel.Reisner@arnoldporter.com>; Dial, Claire Elise <CDial@winston.com>; EntropicKLG <EntropicKLG@klgates.com>; Raghavan, Saranya <SRaghavan@winston.com>

Subject: RE: Entropic v. Charter & Charter (051 and 052 Cases)

KP,

Thank you for the call today.

To recap our conversation:

1. RFAs: Entropic confirms the 30 RFA limit.
2. Interrogatories: Charter is going to go back to the client regarding a possible counter to our request for 50 interrogatories
3. Deposition Hours: Charter is going to go back to the client regarding a possible counter to our request for 80 hours of deposition.
4. Cross Use: At the same time, the parties are going to review whether a cross-use is a feasible alternative. While the structure of this remains up for discussion, Entropic is going to look at Interrogatories in the 125 and 050 case, to see whether certain interrogatories in those cases could be applicable to the consolidated cases such that they need not be re-asked in the Consolidated cases. For these interrogatories, there would be an ongoing obligation to supplement throughout the litigation in this case.
5. Expert Depositions: Charter is going to go back to the client regarding Entropic's proposal that expert depositions be limited to certain topics, such as invalidity, infringement, damages, noninfringement. We are open to specifically articulating such topics to the extent they are generally known. This is not intended to be a situation where one report opens the door to several topics, instead the point is to ensure that an expert does not provide supplemental reports and open the door to additional 7-hour depositions. As I said on the call, this 7 hour per topic is not intended to result in foreclosing the deposition of an expert on a supplemental report. In the event there is a supplemental report after the deposition of an expert, the Entropic expects the parties to work together to set a deposition.

With the deadline to file on Thursday, the parties are going to work to turn around responses as soon as possible, and expect to meet and confer Wednesday afternoon.

We will try to get a response to you in an email so the parties are working from a place of information rather than learning on the call, and we expect Charter will do the same in order to enable the parties to finalize the discovery order this week.

Regards,

Peter Soskin
K&L Gates LLP
4 Embarcadero Center Suite 1200
San Francisco CA 94111
Phone: (415) 882-8046

From: Padmanabhan, Krishnan <KPadmanabhan@winston.com>
Sent: Saturday, August 5, 2023 8:14 AM
To: Soskin, Peter E. <Peter.Soskin@klgates.com>
Cc: Benyacar, David <David.Benyacar@arnoldporter.com>; Boardman, Albert <Albert.Boardman@arnoldporter.com>; Long, Betsy <Elizabeth.Long@arnoldporter.com>; Brown, Melissa <Melissa.Brown@arnoldporter.com>; DeWitt, Amy <Amy.DeWitt@arnoldporter.com>; Dacus, Deron (EXTERNAL) <ddacus@dacusfirm.com>; Wesley Hill <wh@wsfirm.com>; Andrea Fair <andrea@wsfirm.com>; Reisner, Daniel <Daniel.Reisner@arnoldporter.com>; Dial, Claire Elise <CDial@winston.com>; EntropicKLG <EntropicKLG@klgates.com>; Raghavan, Saranya <SRaghavan@winston.com>
Subject: Re: Entropic v. Charter (051 and 052 Cases)

Peter,

Thanks. Look forward to discussing.

KP

Krishnan Padmanabhan

(D) 212-294-3564

(M) 415-632-8214

From: Soskin, Peter E. <Peter.Soskin@klgates.com>

Sent: Saturday, August 5, 2023 10:27:34 AM

To: Padmanabhan, Krishnan <KPadmanabhan@winston.com>

Cc: Benyacar, David <David.Benyacar@arnoldporter.com>; Boardman, Albert <Albert.Boardman@arnoldporter.com>; Long, Betsy <Elizabeth.Long@arnoldporter.com>; Brown, Melissa <Melissa.Brown@arnoldporter.com>; DeWitt, Amy <Amy.DeWitt@arnoldporter.com>; Dacus, Deron (EXTERNAL) <ddacus@dacusfirm.com>; Wesley Hill <wh@wsfirm.com>; Andrea Fair <andrea@wsfirm.com>; Reisner, Daniel <Daniel.Reisner@arnoldporter.com>; Dial, Claire Elise <CDial@winston.com>; EntropicKLG <EntropicKLG@klgates.com>; Raghavan, Saranya <SRaghavan@winston.com>; andrea@wsfirm.com <andrea@wsfirm.com>; wh@wsfirm.com <wh@wsfirm.com>

Subject: RE: Entropic v. Charter & Charter (051 and 052 Cases)

You had asked for Monday morning.

We can do 3:30 central.

Regards,

Peter Soskin

K&L Gates LLP

4 Embarcadero Center Suite 1200

San Francisco CA 94111

Phone: (415) 882-8046

From: Padmanabhan, Krishnan <KPadmanabhan@winston.com>

Sent: Friday, August 4, 2023 8:39 PM

To: Soskin, Peter E. <Peter.Soskin@klgates.com>

Cc: Benyacar, David <David.Benyacar@arnoldporter.com>; Boardman, Albert <Albert.Boardman@arnoldporter.com>; Long, Betsy <Elizabeth.Long@arnoldporter.com>; Brown, Melissa <Melissa.Brown@arnoldporter.com>; DeWitt, Amy <Amy.DeWitt@arnoldporter.com>; Dacus, Deron (EXTERNAL) <ddacus@dacusfirm.com>; Wesley Hill <wh@wsfirm.com>; Andrea Fair <andrea@wsfirm.com>; Reisner, Daniel <Daniel.Reisner@arnoldporter.com>; Dial, Claire Elise <CDial@winston.com>; EntropicKLG <EntropicKLG@klgates.com>; Raghavan, Saranya <SRaghavan@winston.com>; andrea@wsfirm.com; wh@wsfirm.com

Subject: RE: Entropic v. Charter & Charter (051 and 052 Cases)

Peter –

Any possibility the Entropic team is available at 3 CST?

Thanks

KP

Krishnan Padmanabhan

Partner

Winston & Strawn LLP

D: +1 212-294-3564

winston.com



From: Soskin, Peter E. <Peter.Soskin@klgates.com>

Sent: Friday, August 4, 2023 12:50 PM

To: Padmanabhan, Krishnan <KPadmanabhan@winston.com>

Cc: Benyacar, David <David.Benyacar@arnoldporter.com>; Boardman, Albert <Albert.Boardman@arnoldporter.com>; Long, Betsy <Elizabeth.Long@arnoldporter.com>; Brown, Melissa <Melissa.Brown@arnoldporter.com>; DeWitt, Amy <Amy.DeWitt@arnoldporter.com>; Dacus, Deron (EXTERNAL) <ddacus@dacusfirm.com>; Wesley Hill <wh@wsfirm.com>; Andrea Fair <andrea@wsfirm.com>; Reisner, Daniel <Daniel.Reisner@arnoldporter.com>; Dial, Claire Elise <CDial@winston.com>; EntropicKLG <EntropicKLG@klgates.com>; Raghavan, Saranya <SRaghavan@winston.com>; andrea@wsfirm.com; wh@wsfirm.com

Subject: RE: Entropic v. Charter & Charter (051 and 052 Cases)

KP,

Our team is available from 8 am to noon pacific August 7.

Please let us know your availability and I can circulate a dial in.

Thanks,

Peter Soskin

K&L Gates LLP

4 Embarcadero Center Suite 1200

San Francisco CA 94111

Phone: (415) 882-8046

From: Padmanabhan, Krishnan <KPadmanabhan@winston.com>

Sent: Friday, August 4, 2023 6:37 AM

To: Soskin, Peter E. <Peter.Soskin@klgates.com>

Cc: Benyacar, David <David.Benyacar@arnoldporter.com>; Boardman, Albert <Albert.Boardman@arnoldporter.com>; Long, Betsy <Elizabeth.Long@arnoldporter.com>; Brown, Melissa <Melissa.Brown@arnoldporter.com>; DeWitt, Amy <Amy.DeWitt@arnoldporter.com>; Dacus, Deron (EXTERNAL) <ddacus@dacusfirm.com>; Wesley Hill <wh@wsfirm.com>; Andrea Fair <andrea@wsfirm.com>; Reisner, Daniel <Daniel.Reisner@arnoldporter.com>; Dial, Claire Elise <CDial@winston.com>; EntropicKLG <EntropicKLG@klgates.com>; Raghavan, Saranya <SRaghavan@winston.com>

Subject: RE: Entropic v. Charter & Charter (051 and 052 Cases)

Peter –

When can we meet and confer on the Discovery Order? If you can identify a few times, maybe on Monday morning, that would be great.

Thanks
KP

Krishnan Padmanabhan

Partner

Winston & Strawn LLP

D: +1 212-294-3564

winston.com



From: Soskin, Peter E. <Peter.Soskin@klgates.com>

Sent: Thursday, August 3, 2023 6:17 PM

To: Raghavan, Saranya <SRaghavan@winston.com>; Padmanabhan, Krishnan <KPadmanabhan@winston.com>

Cc: Benyacar, David <David.Benyacar@arnoldporter.com>; Boardman, Albert <Albert.Boardman@arnoldporter.com>; Long, Betsy <Elizabeth.Long@arnoldporter.com>; Brown, Melissa <Melissa.Brown@arnoldporter.com>; DeWitt, Amy <Amy.DeWitt@arnoldporter.com>; Dacus, Deron (EXTERNAL) <ddacus@dacusfirm.com>; Wesley Hill <wh@wsfirm.com>; Andrea Fair <andrea@wsfirm.com>; Reisner, Daniel <Daniel.Reisner@arnoldporter.com>; Dial, Claire Elise <CDial@winston.com>; EntropicKLG <EntropicKLG@klgates.com>

Subject: RE: Entropic v. Charter & Charter (051 and 052 Cases)

Thanks - this is just for the discovery order.

Do we have permission to file the DCO and Protective orders?

Regards,

Peter Soskin

K&L Gates LLP

4 Embarcadero Center Suite 1200

San Francisco CA 94111

Phone: (415) 882-8046

From: Raghavan, Saranya <SRaghavan@winston.com>

Sent: Thursday, August 3, 2023 2:57 PM

To: Padmanabhan, Krishnan <KPadmanabhan@winston.com>; Soskin, Peter E. <Peter.Soskin@klgates.com>

Cc: Benyacar, David <David.Benyacar@arnoldporter.com>; Boardman, Albert <Albert.Boardman@arnoldporter.com>; Long, Betsy <Elizabeth.Long@arnoldporter.com>; Brown, Melissa <Melissa.Brown@arnoldporter.com>; DeWitt, Amy <Amy.DeWitt@arnoldporter.com>; Dacus, Deron (EXTERNAL) <ddacus@dacusfirm.com>; Wesley Hill <wh@wsfirm.com>; Andrea Fair <andrea@wsfirm.com>; Reisner, Daniel <Daniel.Reisner@arnoldporter.com>; Dial, Claire Elise <CDial@winston.com>; EntropicKLG <EntropicKLG@klgates.com>

Subject: RE: Entropic v. Charter & Charter (051 and 052 Cases)

Peter -

Attached is the stipulation with signature blocks inserted for Winston, Arnold & Porter, and local counsel.

Thanks,
Saranya

Saranya Raghavan

Associate Attorney

Winston & Strawn LLP

T: +1 312-558-5600

D: +1 312-558-7574

M: +1 312-576-4559

winston.com

Pronouns: She, Her, Hers



From: Padmanabhan, Krishnan <KPadmanabhan@winston.com>

Sent: Thursday, August 3, 2023 4:38 PM

To: Soskin, Peter E. <Peter.Soskin@klgates.com>

Cc: Benyacar, David <David.Benyacar@arnoldporter.com>; Boardman, Albert <Albert.Boardman@arnoldporter.com>; Long, Betsy <Elizabeth.Long@arnoldporter.com>; Brown, Melissa <Melissa.Brown@arnoldporter.com>; DeWitt, Amy <Amy.DeWitt@arnoldporter.com>; Dacus, Deron (EXTERNAL) <ddacus@dacusfirm.com>; Raghavan, Saranya <SRaghavan@winston.com>; Wesley Hill <wh@wsfirm.com>; Andrea Fair <andrea@wsfirm.com>; Reisner, Daniel <Daniel.Reisner@arnoldporter.com>; Dial, Claire Elise <CDial@winston.com>; EntropicKLG <EntropicKLG@klgates.com>

Subject: RE: Entropic v. Charter & Charter (051 and 052 Cases)

Peter -

The stip is coming your way shortly.

Thanks

KP

Krishnan Padmanabhan

Partner

Winston & Strawn LLP

D: +1 212-294-3564

winston.com



From: Soskin, Peter E. <Peter.Soskin@klgates.com>

Sent: Thursday, August 3, 2023 4:41 PM

To: Padmanabhan, Krishnan <KPadmanabhan@winston.com>

Cc: Benyacar, David <David.Benyacar@arnoldporter.com>; Boardman, Albert <Albert.Boardman@arnoldporter.com>; Long, Betsy <Elizabeth.Long@arnoldporter.com>; Brown, Melissa <Melissa.Brown@arnoldporter.com>; DeWitt, Amy <Amy.DeWitt@arnoldporter.com>; Dacus, Deron (EXTERNAL) <ddacus@dacusfirm.com>; Raghavan, Saranya <SRaghavan@winston.com>; Wesley Hill <wh@wsfirm.com>; Andrea Fair <andrea@wsfirm.com>; Reisner, Daniel <Daniel.Reisner@arnoldporter.com>; Dial, Claire Elise <CDial@winston.com>; EntropicKLG <EntropicKLG@klgates.com>

Subject: RE: Entropic v. Charter & Charter (051 and 052 Cases)

KP, following up on this.

Regards,

Peter Soskin
K&L Gates LLP
4 Embarcadero Center Suite 1200
San Francisco CA 94111
Phone: (415) 882-8046

From: Soskin, Peter E.
Sent: Thursday, August 3, 2023 9:56 AM
To: 'Padmanabhan, Krishnan' <KPadmanabhan@winston.com>
Cc: Benyacar, David <David.Benyacar@arnoldporter.com>; Boardman, Albert <Albert.Boardman@arnoldporter.com>; Long, Betsy <Elizabeth.Long@arnoldporter.com>; Brown, Melissa <Melissa.Brown@arnoldporter.com>; DeWitt, Amy <Amy.DeWitt@arnoldporter.com>; Dacus, Deron (EXTERNAL) <ddacus@dacusfirm.com>; Raghavan, Saranya <SRaghavan@winston.com>; Wesley Hill <wh@wsfirm.com>; Andrea Fair <andrea@wsfirm.com>; Reisner, Daniel <Daniel.Reisner@arnoldporter.com>; Dial, Claire Elise <CDial@winston.com>; EntropicKLG <EntropicKLG@klgates.com>
Subject: RE: Entropic v. Charter & Charter (051 and 052 Cases)

KP,

Attached is the proposed motion for a one week extension.

Please input the correct signature block so we can get it on file.

Thanks,

Peter Soskin
K&L Gates LLP
4 Embarcadero Center Suite 1200
San Francisco CA 94111
Phone: (415) 882-8046

From: Padmanabhan, Krishnan <KPadmanabhan@winston.com>
Sent: Wednesday, August 2, 2023 5:49 PM
To: Soskin, Peter E. <Peter.Soskin@klgates.com>
Cc: Benyacar, David <David.Benyacar@arnoldporter.com>; Boardman, Albert <Albert.Boardman@arnoldporter.com>; Long, Betsy <Elizabeth.Long@arnoldporter.com>; Brown, Melissa <Melissa.Brown@arnoldporter.com>; DeWitt, Amy <Amy.DeWitt@arnoldporter.com>; Dacus, Deron (EXTERNAL) <ddacus@dacusfirm.com>; Raghavan, Saranya <SRaghavan@winston.com>; Wesley Hill <wh@wsfirm.com>; Andrea Fair <andrea@wsfirm.com>; Reisner, Daniel <Daniel.Reisner@arnoldporter.com>; Dial, Claire Elise <CDial@winston.com>; EntropicKLG <EntropicKLG@klgates.com>
Subject: RE: Entropic v. Charter & Charter (051 and 052 Cases)

Peter –

I have been in a deposition today. In any event, we would need the opportunity to discuss your proposal with our client, so it makes the most sense to request a one-week extension to give us time to discuss internally, and then for the parties to discuss as necessary.

Entropic's offer to cross-use of discovery is an admission the MoCA-2 case (23-cv-51) will share subject matter with the MoCA-1 case (23-cv-50), and that the Cable-2 case (23-cv-52) will share material with the Cable-1 case (22-cv-125). And it only supports deconsolidation of the MoCA-2 and Cable-2 cases, and consolidation of the MoCA-1/MoCA-2 and consolidation of the Cable-1/Cable-2 cases.

In any event, please circulate a one-week extension so that we have time to discuss and consider Entropic's new proposal.

Thanks,
KP

Krishnan Padmanabhan

Partner

Winston & Strawn LLP

D: +1 212-294-3564

winston.com



From: Soskin, Peter E. <Peter.Soskin@klgates.com>

Sent: Wednesday, August 2, 2023 7:39 PM

To: Padmanabhan, Krishnan <KPadmanabhan@winston.com>

Cc: Benyacar, David <David.Benyacar@arnoldporter.com>; Boardman, Albert <Albert.Boardman@arnoldporter.com>; Long, Betsy <Elizabeth.Long@arnoldporter.com>; Brown, Melissa <Melissa.Brown@arnoldporter.com>; DeWitt, Amy <Amy.DeWitt@arnoldporter.com>; Dacus, Deron (EXTERNAL) <ddacus@dacusfirm.com>; Raghavan, Saranya <SRaghavan@winston.com>; Wesley Hill <wh@wsfirm.com>; Andrea Fair <andrea@wsfirm.com>; Reisner, Daniel <Daniel.Reisner@arnoldporter.com>; Dial, Claire Elise <CDial@winston.com>; EntropicKLG <EntropicKLG@klgates.com>

Subject: RE: Entropic v. Charter & Charter (051 and 052 Cases)

KP, following up on this.

Does Charter agree to my proposal below?

Peter Soskin

K&L Gates LLP

4 Embarcadero Center Suite 1200

San Francisco CA 94111

Phone: (415) 882-8046

From: Soskin, Peter E.

Sent: Wednesday, August 2, 2023 11:10 AM

To: 'Padmanabhan, Krishnan' <KPadmanabhan@winston.com>

Cc: Benyacar, David <David.Benyacar@arnoldporter.com>; Boardman, Albert <Albert.Boardman@arnoldporter.com>; Long, Betsy <Elizabeth.Long@arnoldporter.com>; Brown, Melissa <Melissa.Brown@arnoldporter.com>; DeWitt, Amy <Amy.DeWitt@arnoldporter.com>; Dacus, Deron (EXTERNAL) <ddacus@dacusfirm.com>; Raghavan, Saranya <SRaghavan@winston.com>; Wesley Hill <wh@wsfirm.com>; Andrea Fair <andrea@wsfirm.com>; Reisner, Daniel <Daniel.Reisner@arnoldporter.com>; Dial, Claire Elise <CDial@winston.com>; EntropicKLG <EntropicKLG@klgates.com>

<Daniel.Reisner@arnoldporter.com>; Dial, Claire Elise <CDial@winston.com>

Subject: RE: Entropic v. Charter & Charter (051 and 052 Cases)

KP,

Your justification for maintaining the discovery limits is that each of the other cases had those limits. But this is two cases those are each one case. Additionally, Charter represented to the Court that “discovery will not overlap in any meaningful way.” Thus, based on Charter’s own logic, additional interrogatories and deposition hours are justified.

As a potential compromise, please let us know if Charter agrees to cross-use of the discovery in the other cases. This may eliminate the need for redundant discovery and lead to efficiencies across the board.

If Charter agrees to this, the limits proposed by Charter would likely be acceptable, though we would reserve rights to seek additional discovery if necessary.

Regards,

Peter Soskin
K&L Gates LLP
4 Embarcadero Center Suite 1200
San Francisco CA 94111
Phone: (415) 882-8046

From: Padmanabhan, Krishnan <KPadmanabhan@winston.com>
Sent: Wednesday, August 2, 2023 10:26 AM
To: Soskin, Peter E. <Peter.Soskin@klgates.com>
Cc: Benyacar, David <David.Benyacar@arnoldporter.com>; Boardman, Albert <Albert.Boardman@arnoldporter.com>; Long, Betsy <Elizabeth.Long@arnoldporter.com>; Brown, Melissa <Melissa.Brown@arnoldporter.com>; DeWitt, Amy <Amy.DeWitt@arnoldporter.com>; Dacus, Deron (EXTERNAL) <ddacus@dacusfirm.com>; Raghavan, Saranya <SRaghavan@winston.com>; Wesley Hill <wh@wsfirm.com>; Andrea Fair <andrea@wsfirm.com>; Reisner, Daniel <Daniel.Reisner@arnoldporter.com>; Dial, Claire Elise <CDial@winston.com>
Subject: RE: Entropic v. Charter & Charter (051 and 052 Cases)

Peter -

I don't speak for Arnold and Porter, but my email was on behalf of both firms across both the 23-cv-51 and 23-cv-52 matters.

We can discuss on our end and identify some times to meet and confer. It will likely be tomorrow, since we have several team members traveling.

Thanks
KP

Krishnan Padmanabhan
Partner
Winston & Strawn LLP

D: +1 212-294-3564

winston.com



From: Soskin, Peter E. <Peter.Soskin@klgates.com>

Sent: Wednesday, August 2, 2023 1:22 PM

To: Padmanabhan, Krishnan <KPadmanabhan@winston.com>

Cc: Benyacar, David <David.Benyacar@arnoldporter.com>; Boardman, Albert <Albert.Boardman@arnoldporter.com>; Long, Betsy <Elizabeth.Long@arnoldporter.com>; Brown, Melissa <Melissa.Brown@arnoldporter.com>; DeWitt, Amy <Amy.DeWitt@arnoldporter.com>; Dacus, Deron (EXTERNAL) <ddacus@dacusfirm.com>; Raghavan, Saranya <SRaghavan@winston.com>; Wesley Hill <wh@wsfirm.com>; Andrea Fair <andrea@wsfirm.com>; Reisner, Daniel <Daniel.Reisner@arnoldporter.com>; Dial, Claire Elise <CDial@winston.com>

Subject: RE: Entropic v. Charter & Charter (051 and 052 Cases)

Please let us know when you are available to meet and confer about this.

Also, again, please confirm one way or another whether you speak for Arnold & Porter as well.

Regards,

Peter Soskin
K&L Gates LLP
4 Embarcadero Center Suite 1200
San Francisco CA 94111
Phone: (415) 882-8046

From: Padmanabhan, Krishnan <KPadmanabhan@winston.com>

Sent: Wednesday, August 2, 2023 10:21 AM

To: Soskin, Peter E. <Peter.Soskin@klgates.com>

Cc: Benyacar, David <David.Benyacar@arnoldporter.com>; Boardman, Albert <Albert.Boardman@arnoldporter.com>; Long, Betsy <Elizabeth.Long@arnoldporter.com>; Brown, Melissa <Melissa.Brown@arnoldporter.com>; DeWitt, Amy <Amy.DeWitt@arnoldporter.com>; Dacus, Deron (EXTERNAL) <ddacus@dacusfirm.com>; Raghavan, Saranya <SRaghavan@winston.com>; Wesley Hill <wh@wsfirm.com>; Andrea Fair <andrea@wsfirm.com>; Reisner, Daniel <Daniel.Reisner@arnoldporter.com>; Dial, Claire Elise <CDial@winston.com>

Subject: RE: Entropic v. Charter & Charter (051 and 052 Cases)

Peter,

On the DCO and PO, you can proceed with our signatures.

On the Discovery Order we cannot agree to Entropic's proposed limits, which exceed the previously agreed Discovery Orders in the 22-cv-125 and 23-cv-50 matters.

It appears that we are submitting the Discovery Order as contested. Can you please circulate a document where each party can put in their respective positions?

Thanks,

KP

Krishnan Padmanabhan

Partner

Winston & Strawn LLP

D: +1 212-294-3564

winston.com



From: Soskin, Peter E. <Peter.Soskin@klgates.com>

Sent: Wednesday, August 2, 2023 12:03 PM

To: Padmanabhan, Krishnan <KPadmanabhan@winston.com>

Cc: Benyacar, David <David.Benyacar@arnoldporter.com>; Boardman, Albert <Albert.Boardman@arnoldporter.com>; Long, Betsy <Elizabeth.Long@arnoldporter.com>; Brown, Melissa <Melissa.Brown@arnoldporter.com>; DeWitt, Amy <Amy.DeWitt@arnoldporter.com>; Dacus, Deron (EXTERNAL) <ddacus@dacusfirm.com>; Raghavan, Saranya <SRaghavan@winston.com>; Wesley Hill <wh@wsfirm.com>; Andrea Fair <andrea@wsfirm.com>; Reisner, Daniel <Daniel.Reisner@arnoldporter.com>

Subject: RE: Entropic v. Charter & Charter (051 and 052 Cases)

KP & Dan,

I am following up on my email yesterday. These are due tomorrow, and I would like to be able to file all of them together rather than a motion for an extension.

Please let me know whether we are going to come to an agreement on the discovery order. In the meantime, please let me know if we have your permission to use your e-signatures for both firms on the DCO and Protective Order.

Regards,

Peter Soskin

K&L Gates LLP

4 Embarcadero Center Suite 1200

San Francisco CA 94111

Phone: (415) 882-8046

From: Soskin, Peter E.

Sent: Tuesday, August 1, 2023 9:55 AM

To: 'Padmanabhan, Krishnan' <KPadmanabhan@winston.com>

Cc: Benyacar, David <David.Benyacar@arnoldporter.com>; Boardman, Albert <Albert.Boardman@arnoldporter.com>; Long, Betsy <Elizabeth.Long@arnoldporter.com>; Brown, Melissa <Melissa.Brown@arnoldporter.com>; DeWitt, Amy <Amy.DeWitt@arnoldporter.com>; Dacus, Deron (EXTERNAL) <ddacus@dacusfirm.com>; Raghavan, Saranya <SRaghavan@winston.com>; Wesley Hill <wh@wsfirm.com>; Andrea Fair <andrea@wsfirm.com>; Reisner, Daniel <Daniel.Reisner@arnoldporter.com>

Subject: RE: Entropic v. Charter & Charter (051 and 052 Cases)

Thank you KP,

Can you tell me if you are speaking for Charter for both cases?

We included these discovery numbers based on our experience with Charter in the 125 Action and the fact that there are patents that address different technologies in these two cases.

In the 125 Case, Charter identified over 12 witnesses that would testify relating to 12(b)(6) issues. We need the 80 hours of deposition time to avoid this issue again.

We can agree to the 30 Requests for Admission, but we need more interrogatories. We can agree to 45.

As for the expert testimony. We are trying to avoid a situation where an expert who presents a supplemental report is subject to 7 hours on their initial report, and then another 7 hours on a supplemental report, especially if the supplemental report is the result of untimely discovery -- which will likely be the case in the 125 case. In such a case, the information in the supplemental report would have been part of the initial report the first place, but the party serving untimely discovery is then rewarded by being able to take a 14 hour deposition of the expert.

We propose keeping it at 7 hours per substantive issue, and adding language to the effect of "subject to additional hours upon agreement by the parties or for good cause." This may be redundant, but it reflects that the parties appreciate things may come up on this point.

Please let me know if we can agree based on my proposal above.

Regards,

Peter Soskin
K&L Gates LLP
4 Embarcadero Center Suite 1200
San Francisco CA 94111
Phone: (415) 882-8046

From: Padmanabhan, Krishnan <KPadmanabhan@winston.com>
Sent: Tuesday, August 1, 2023 7:28 AM
To: Soskin, Peter E. <Peter.Soskin@klgates.com>
Cc: Benyacar, David <David.Benyacar@arnoldporter.com>; Boardman, Albert <Albert.Boardman@arnoldporter.com>; Long, Betsy <Elizabeth.Long@arnoldporter.com>; Brown, Melissa <Melissa.Brown@arnoldporter.com>; DeWitt, Amy <Amy.DeWitt@arnoldporter.com>; Dacus, Deron (EXTERNAL) <ddacus@dacusfirm.com>; Raghavan, Saranya <SRaghavan@winston.com>; Wesley Hill <wh@wsfirm.com>; Andrea Fair <andrea@wsfirm.com>; Reisner, Daniel <Daniel.Reisner@arnoldporter.com>
Subject: RE: Entropic v. Charter & Charter (051 and 052 Cases)

Peter –

Please find Charter's edits to the Discovery Order in the attached redline. These edits bring the Discovery Order in line with the 23-cv-050 matter and 22-cv-125 matter.

The DCO and PO appear to be fine (although paragraph 5(a) of the PO has a typographical error "these consolidated Actions" or "this consolidated Action").

Thanks,
KP

Krishnan Padmanabhan

Partner

Winston & Strawn LLP

D: +1 212-294-3564

winston.com



From: Soskin, Peter E. <Peter.Soskin@klgates.com>

Sent: Friday, July 28, 2023 5:42 PM

To: Padmanabhan, Krishnan <KPadmanabhan@winston.com>; Reisner, Daniel <Daniel.Reisner@arnoldporter.com>

Cc: Benyacar, David <David.Benyacar@arnoldporter.com>; Boardman, Albert <Albert.Boardman@arnoldporter.com>;

Long, Betsy <Elizabeth.Long@arnoldporter.com>; Brown, Melissa <Melissa.Brown@arnoldporter.com>; DeWitt, Amy

<Amy.DeWitt@arnoldporter.com>; Dacus, Deron (EXTERNAL) <ddacus@dacusfirm.com>; Raghavan, Saranya

<SRaghavan@winston.com>; Wesley Hill <wh@wsfirm.com>; Andrea Fair <andrea@wsfirm.com>

Subject: Entropic v. Charter & Charter (051 and 052 Cases)

Counsel,

Attached are proposed Discovery, Protective, and Docket Control orders that are **due August 3**.

The Protective order is the same order to which Charter agreed in the 050 case. The discovery order is largely the same, but has minor revisions given the consolidation.

Please get us any edits by August 2, and if you do not think you can do so, please let us know as soon as possible so we can jointly request an extension of the deadline.

Regards,



Peter Soskin

K&L Gates LLP

4 Embarcadero Center Suite 1200

San Francisco CA 94111

Phone: (415) 882-8046

Fax: (415) 882-8220

peter.soskin@klgates.com

www.klgates.com

This electronic message contains information from the law firm of K&L Gates LLP. The contents may be privileged and confidential and are intended for the use of the intended addressee(s) only. If you are not an intended addressee, note that any disclosure, copying, distribution, or use of the contents of this message is prohibited. If you have received this e-mail in error, please contact me at Peter.Soskin@klgates.com.

The contents of this message may be privileged and confidential. If this message has been received in error, please delete it without reading it. Your receipt of this message is not intended to waive any applicable privilege. Please do not disseminate this message without the permission of the author. Any tax advice contained in this email was not intended to be used, and cannot be used, by you (or any other taxpayer) to avoid penalties under applicable tax laws and regulations.

This electronic message contains information from the law firm of K&L Gates LLP. The contents may be privileged and confidential and are intended for the use of the intended addressee(s) only. If you are not an intended addressee, note that any disclosure, copying, distribution, or use of the contents of this message is prohibited. If you have received this e-mail in error, please contact me at Peter.Soskin@klgates.com.

This electronic message contains information from the law firm of K&L Gates LLP. The contents may be privileged and confidential and are intended for the use of the intended addressee(s) only. If you are not an intended addressee, note that any disclosure, copying, distribution, or use of the contents of this message is prohibited. If you have received this e-mail in error, please contact me at Peter.Soskin@klgates.com.

This electronic message contains information from the law firm of K&L Gates LLP. The contents may be privileged and confidential and are intended for the use of the intended addressee(s) only. If you are not an intended addressee, note that any disclosure, copying, distribution, or use of the contents of this message is prohibited. If you have received this e-mail in error, please contact me at Peter.Soskin@klgates.com.

This electronic message contains information from the law firm of K&L Gates LLP. The contents may be privileged and confidential and are intended for the use of the intended addressee(s) only. If you are not an intended addressee, note that any disclosure, copying, distribution, or use of the contents of this message is prohibited. If you have received this e-mail in error, please contact me at Peter.Soskin@klgates.com.

This electronic message contains information from the law firm of K&L Gates LLP. The contents may be privileged and confidential and are intended for the use of the intended addressee(s) only. If you are not an intended addressee, note that any disclosure, copying, distribution, or use of the contents of this message is prohibited. If you have received this e-mail in error, please contact me at Peter.Soskin@klgates.com.

This electronic message contains information from the law firm of K&L Gates LLP. The contents may be privileged and confidential and are intended for the use of the intended addressee(s) only. If you are not an intended addressee, note that any disclosure, copying, distribution, or use of the contents of this message is prohibited. If you have received this e-mail in error, please contact me at Peter.Soskin@klgates.com.

This electronic message contains information from the law firm of K&L Gates LLP. The contents may be privileged and confidential and are intended for the use of the intended addressee(s) only. If you are not an intended addressee, note that any disclosure, copying, distribution, or use of the contents of this message is prohibited. If you have received this e-mail in error, please contact me at Peter.Soskin@klgates.com.

This electronic message contains information from the law firm of K&L Gates LLP. The contents may be privileged and confidential and are intended for the use of the intended addressee(s) only. If you are not an intended addressee, note that any disclosure, copying, distribution, or use of the contents of this message is prohibited. If you have received this e-mail in error, please contact me at Peter.Soskin@klgates.com.

This electronic message contains information from the law firm of K&L Gates LLP. The contents may be privileged and confidential and are intended for the use of the intended addressee(s) only. If you are not an intended addressee, note that any disclosure, copying, distribution, or use of the contents of this message is prohibited. If you have received this e-mail in error, please contact me at Christina.Goodrich@klgates.com.

This electronic message contains information from the law firm of K&L Gates LLP. The contents may be privileged and confidential and are intended for the use of the intended addressee(s) only. If you are not an intended addressee, note that any disclosure, copying, distribution, or use of the contents of this message is prohibited. If you have received this e-mail in error, please contact me at Christina.Goodrich@klgates.com.